THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY OF PENNSYLVANIA

HOUSE BILL No. 1391 Session of 2021

INTRODUCED BY SAYLOR, R. BROWN, HELM, KEEFER, LEWIS DELROSSO, MILLARD, MOUL, PICKETT, ROTHMAN, RYAN, WHEELAND AND ZIMMERMAN, MAY 14, 2021

REFERRED TO COMMITTEE ON JUDICIARY, MAY 14, 2021

A JOINT RESOLUTION

1 2 3 4 5	Proposing integrated amendments to the Constitution of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, providing for hearing and deciding cases involving dissolution of marriage, custody, child support, spousal support, alimony, equitable division of marital property and related family law matters.
6	The General Assembly of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania
7	hereby resolves as follows:
8	Section 1. The following integrated amendments to the
9	Constitution of Pennsylvania are proposed in accordance with
10	Article XI:
11	(1) That section 5 of Article V be amended to read:
12	§ 5. Courts of common pleas.
13	There shall be one court of common pleas for each judicial
14	district (a) having such divisions and consisting of such number
15	of judges as shall be provided by law, one of whom shall be the
16	<pre>president judge; [and]</pre>
17	(b) having unlimited original jurisdiction in all cases
18	except as may otherwise be provided by law[.];

1 (c) having a procedure for the disposition of cases 2 involving dissolution of marriage, custody, child support, spousal support, alimony, alimony pendente lite, equitable 3 division of marital property and related family law matters as 4 provided by statute; 5 6 (d) having a family resource center as provided by statute; 7 and 8 (e) having educational requirements for judges and family law masters and mediators as provided by statute. 9 10 That section 10(c) of Article V be amended to read: (2)§ 10. Judicial administration. 11

12 * * *

13 The Supreme Court shall have the power to prescribe (C) 14 general rules governing practice, procedure and the conduct of 15 all courts, justices of the peace and all officers serving 16 process or enforcing orders, judgments or decrees of any court or justice of the peace, including the power to provide for 17 assignment and reassignment of classes of actions or classes of 18 19 appeals among the several courts as the needs of justice shall 20 require, and for admission to the bar and to practice law, and 21 the administration of all courts and supervision of all officers of the Judicial Branch, if such rules are consistent with this 22 23 Constitution and neither abridge, enlarge nor modify the 24 substantive rights of any litigant, nor affect the right of the General Assembly to determine the jurisdiction of any court or 25 26 justice of the peace, nor suspend nor alter any statute of limitation or repose. [All] Except for statutes enacted pursuant_ 27 to section 5 of this article, all laws shall be suspended to the 28 29 extent that they are inconsistent with rules prescribed under 30 these provisions. Notwithstanding the provisions of this

20210HB1391PN1507

- 2 -

section, the General Assembly may by statute provide for the
 manner of testimony of child victims or child material witnesses
 in criminal proceedings, including the use of videotaped
 depositions or testimony by closed-circuit television.

5 * * *

6 (3) That section 18(a)(7), (8) and (9), (b)(5), (c)(1), (3)
7 and (4) and (d) introductory paragraph, (1), (2) and (3) of
8 Article V be amended to read:

9 § 18. Suspension, removal, discipline and other sanctions.
10 (a) There shall be an independent board within the Judicial
11 Branch, known as the Judicial Conduct Board, the composition,
12 powers and duties of which shall be as follows:

13 * * *

The board shall receive and investigate complaints 14 (7) 15 regarding judicial conduct filed by individuals or initiated by 16 the board against a justice, judge, justice of the peace or family law master; issue subpoenas to compel testimony under 17 18 oath of witnesses, including the subject of the investigation, 19 and to compel the production of documents, books, accounts and 20 other records relevant to the investigation; determine whether there is probable cause to file formal charges against a 21 justice, judge [or], justice of the peace or family law master 22 23 for conduct proscribed by this section; and present the case in 24 support of the charges before the Court of Judicial Discipline.

(8) Complaints filed with the board or initiated by the board shall not be public information. Statements, testimony, documents, records or other information or evidence acquired by the board in the conduct of an investigation shall not be public information. A justice, judge [or], justice of the peace or <u>family law master</u> who is the subject of a complaint filed with

20210HB1391PN1507

- 3 -

the board or initiated by the board or of an investigation 1 2 conducted by the board shall be apprised of the nature and 3 content of the complaint and afforded an opportunity to respond fully to the complaint prior to any probable cause determination 4 by the board. All proceedings of the board shall be confidential 5 except when the subject of the investigation waives 6 confidentiality. If, independent of any action by the board, the 7 8 fact that an investigation by the board is in progress becomes a 9 matter of public record, the board may, at the direction of the 10 subject of the investigation, issue a statement to confirm that the investigation is in progress, to clarify the procedural 11 aspects of the proceedings, to explain the rights of the subject 12 13 of the investigation to a fair hearing without prejudgment or to 14 provide the response of the subject of the investigation to the 15 complaint. In acting to dismiss a complaint for lack of probable 16 cause to file formal charges, the board may, at its discretion, issue a statement or report to the complainant or to the subject 17 18 of the complaint, which may contain the identity of the 19 complainant, the identity of the subject of the complaint, the 20 contents and nature of the complaint, the actions taken in the conduct of the investigation and the results and conclusions of 21 the investigation. The board may include with a report a copy of 22 23 information or evidence acquired in the course of the 24 investigation.

(9) If the board finds probable cause to file formal charges concerning mental or physical disability against a justice, judge [or], justice of the peace <u>or family law master</u>, the board shall so notify the subject of the charges and provide the subject with an opportunity to resign from [judicial] <u>his</u> office or, when appropriate, to enter a rehabilitation program prior to

20210HB1391PN1507

- 4 -

the filing of the formal charges with the Court of Judicial
 Discipline.

3 * * *

4 (b) There shall be a Court of Judicial Discipline, the
5 composition, powers and duties of which shall be as follows:
6 * * *

7 (5) Upon the filing of formal charges with the court by the 8 board, the court shall promptly schedule a hearing or hearings to determine whether a sanction should be imposed against a 9 10 justice, judge [or], justice of the peace or family law master pursuant to the provisions of this section. The court shall be a 11 court of record, with all the attendant duties and powers 12 13 appropriate to its function. Formal charges filed with the court shall be a matter of public record. All hearings conducted by 14 15 the court shall be public proceedings conducted pursuant to the 16 rules adopted by the court and in accordance with the principles of due process and the law of evidence. Parties appearing before 17 18 the court shall have a right to discovery pursuant to the rules 19 adopted by the court and shall have the right to subpoena 20 witnesses and to compel the production of documents, books, accounts and other records as relevant. The subject of the 21 charges shall be presumed innocent in any proceeding before the 22 23 court, and the board shall have the burden of proving the 24 charges by clear and convincing evidence. All decisions of the 25 court shall be in writing and shall contain findings of fact and 26 conclusions of law. A decision of the court may order removal from office, suspension, censure or other discipline as 27 28 authorized by this section and as warranted by the record. * * * 29

30 (c) Decisions of the court shall be subject to review as
20210HB1391PN1507 - 5 -

1 follows:

2 (1) A justice, judge [or], justice of the peace or family 3 law master shall have the right to appeal a final adverse order of discipline of the court. A judge [or], justice of the peace 4 5 or family law master shall have the right to appeal to the Supreme Court in a manner consistent with rules adopted by the 6 Supreme Court; a justice shall have the right to appeal to a 7 special tribunal composed of seven judges, other than senior 8 9 judges, chosen by lot from the judges of the Superior Court and Commonwealth Court who do not sit on the Court of Judicial 10 11 Discipline or the board, in a manner consistent with rules 12 adopted by the Supreme Court. The special tribunal shall hear 13 and decide the appeal in the same manner in which the Supreme 14 Court would hear and decide an appeal from an order of the 15 court.

16 * * *

(3) An order of the court which dismisses a complaint 17 18 against a judge [or] justice of the peace or family law master 19 may be appealed by the board to the Supreme Court, but the 20 appeal shall be limited to questions of law. An order of the 21 court which dismisses a complaint against a justice of the 22 Supreme Court may be appealed by the board to a special tribunal 23 in accordance with paragraph (1), but the appeal shall be 24 limited to questions of law.

(4) No justice, judge [or], justice of the peace or family
<u>law master</u> may participate as a member of the board, the court,
a special tribunal or the Supreme Court in any proceeding in
which the justice, judge or justice of the peace is a
complainant, the subject of a complaint, a party or a witness.
(d) A justice, judge [or], justice of the peace <u>or family</u>

20210HB1391PN1507

- 6 -

1 <u>law master</u> shall be subject to disciplinary action pursuant to 2 this section as follows:

3 (1) A justice, judge [or], justice of the peace or family law master may be suspended, removed from office or otherwise 4 disciplined for conviction of a felony; [violation of section 17] 5 of this article;] misconduct in office; neglect or failure to 6 7 perform the duties of office or conduct which prejudices the 8 proper administration of justice or brings the judicial office 9 into disrepute, whether or not the conduct occurred while acting 10 in a judicial capacity or is prohibited by law; or conduct in violation of a canon or rule prescribed by the Supreme Court. A 11 justice, judge or justice of the peace may be suspended, removed 12 13 from office or otherwise disciplined for a violation of section 14 17 of this article. A judge or family law master may be suspended or removed from office for failure to complete 15 16 judicial education requirements as provided by statute. In the case of a mentally or physically disabled justice, judge [or], 17 18 justice of the peace or family law master, the court may enter an order of removal from office, retirement, suspension or other 19 20 limitations on the activities of the justice, judge [or], justice of the peace or family law master as warranted by the 21 record. Upon a final order of the court for suspension without 22 23 pay or removal, prior to any appeal, the justice, judge [or], 24 justice of the peace or family law master shall be suspended or 25 removed from office; and the salary of the justice, judge [or], justice of the peace or family law master shall cease from the 26 27 date of the order.

(2) Prior to a hearing, the court may issue an interim order
directing the suspension, with or without pay, of any justice,
judge [or], justice of the peace or family law master against

20210HB1391PN1507

- 7 -

1 whom formal charges have been filed with the court by the board 2 or against whom has been filed an indictment or information 3 charging a felony. An interim order under this paragraph shall 4 not be considered a final order from which an appeal may be 5 taken.

6 (3) A justice, judge [or], justice of the peace or family
7 <u>law master</u> convicted of misbehavior in office by a court,
8 disbarred as a member of the bar of the Supreme Court or removed
9 under this section shall forfeit automatically his judicial
10 office and thereafter be ineligible for judicial office.
11 * * *

12 Upon passage by the General Assembly of Section 2. (a) 13 these proposed constitutional amendments, the Secretary of the 14 Commonwealth shall proceed immediately to comply with the 15 advertising requirements of section 1 of Article XI of the 16 Constitution of Pennsylvania and shall transmit the required 17 advertisements to two newspapers in every county in which such newspapers are published in sufficient time after passage of 18 these proposed constitutional amendments to permit publication 19 20 at least three months before the next general election.

21 (b) Upon the second passage of these proposed constitutional 22 amendments by the General Assembly, the Secretary of the 23 Commonwealth shall proceed immediately to comply with the 24 advertising requirements of section 1 of Article XI of the 25 Constitution of Pennsylvania and shall transmit the required 26 advertisements to two newspapers in every county in which such newspapers are published in sufficient time after passage of 27 28 these proposed constitutional amendments to permit publication 29 at least three months before the next general election. The 30 Secretary of the Commonwealth shall submit these proposed

20210HB1391PN1507

- 8 -

constitutional amendments to the qualified electors of this
 Commonwealth at the first primary, general or municipal election
 occurring at least three months after the proposed
 constitutional amendments are passed by the General Assembly and
 conforming to section 1 of Article XI of the Constitution of
 Pennsylvania.